

DAVID H. FRY (SBN 189276)
MARL CONRAD (SBN 255667)
MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSEN LLP
560 Mission Street, 27th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94105-2907
Telephone: 415-512-4000
Facsimile: 415-512-4077
Email: David.Fry@mto.com

GERALD A. McINTYRE (SBN 181746)
NATIONAL SENIOR CITIZENS LAW CENTER
3435 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 2860
Los Angeles, CA 90010-1938
Telephone: 213-674-2900
Facsimile: 213-639-0934
Email: gmcintyre@nslc.org

ANNA RICH (SBN 230195)
KEVIN PRINDIVILLE (SBN 235835)
NATIONAL SENIOR CITIZENS LAW CENTER
1330 Broadway, Suite 525
Oakland, CA 94612
Telephone: 510-663-1055
Facsimile: 510-663-1051
Email: arich@nclc.org
kprindiville@nclc.org

Of Counsel
EMILIA SICILIA
JENNIFER PARISH
URBAN JUSTICE CENTER
123 William Street, 16th Fl.
New York, NY 10038
Telephone: 646-602-5668
Facsimile: 212-533-4598
Email: wlienhard@urbanjustice.org
Esicilia@urbanjustice.org
Jparish@urbanjustice.org

Of Counsel Cont'd
MARILYN HOLLE (SBN 61530)
DISABILITY RIGHTS CALIFORNIA
3580 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 902
Los Angeles, CA 90010-2522
Telephone: 213-427-8747
Facsimile: 213-427-8767
Email: marilyn.holle@disabilityrightsca.org
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

CHRISTOPHER DOUGLAS (SBN 239556)
LEGAL AID SOCIETY
521 East 5th Ave.,
San Mateo, CA 94402
Telephone: 650-558-0915
Facsimile: 650-558-0673
Email: cdouglas@legalaidsmc.org
Mshawver@legalaidsmc.org

JOSEPH P. RUSSONIELLO (CSBN 118321)
United States Attorney
JOANN M. SWANSON (CSBN 88143)
Chief, Civil Division
MICHAEL T. PYLE (CSBN 172954)
Assistant United States Attorney
VICTORIA R. CARRADERO (CSBN 217885)
Assistant United States Attorney
450 Golden Gate Avenue, 9th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102-3495
Telephone: (415) 436-7181
Facsimile: (415) 436-6748
Email: victoria.carradero@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Defendant

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

ROSA MARTINEZ, JIMMY HOWARD,
ROBERTA DOBBS, BRENT A.
RODERICK, SHARON D. ROZIER, and
JOSEPH SUTRYNOWICZ, on behalf of
themselves and all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

MICHAEL J. ASTRUE,
Commissioner of Social Security,

Defendant.

No. CV-08-4735-CW

**STIPULATION AND
ORDER RE
CONFIDENTIAL
INFORMATION**

1 Plaintiffs Rosa Martinez, Jimmy Howard, Roberta Dobbs, Brent A. Roderick, Sharon D. Rozier
 2 and Joseph Sutrynowicz (collectively "Plaintiffs"), and Defendant Michael J. Astrue, Commissioner,
 3 Social Security Administration ("Defendant"), by and through their undersigned counsel, hereby
 4 stipulate as follows:

5 **STIPULATED ORDER**

6 The parties agree that entry of the following protective order is necessary in order for the parties
 7 to exchange and discuss information that the Social Security Administration ("SSA") considers to be
 8 confidential and proprietary technical information pertaining to SSA's internal systems. The parties
 9 therefore request that the Court enter the following protective order pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil
 10 Procedure 26(c).

11 All documents (including but not limited to, email communications) exchanged between the
 12 parties that discuss technical system matters (including, but not limited to, agency systems coding/
 13 programming information) and designated as such, shall be subject to the following restrictions:

14 1. All information shall be used only for the purpose of this litigation and not for any other
 15 purpose;

16 2. Plaintiffs' counsel shall not disclose the information at any time (verbally or otherwise),
 17 including to the Plaintiffs or to the public. Access to the information is permitted only to the Plaintiffs'
 18 attorneys exclusively for the purpose of reviewing draft documents under the Martinez Stipulation of
 19 Settlement, and not to the Plaintiffs themselves or any other person(s). There shall be no reproduction
 20 of the information by Plaintiffs' counsel (electronically or otherwise, this includes scanning or emailing)
 21 except for reproduction for purposes of review by Plaintiffs' counsel. To the extent these matters need
 22 to be raised with the Court, the information shall be submitted to the Court for in camera review only,
 23 and shall not be filed with the Court or become part of the court record or public record. The Court shall
 24 return the information to SSA upon resolution of the specific issue for which the information was
 25 submitted for in camera review.

26 3. Within three (3) business days of the conclusion of the time period allotted for Plaintiffs'
 27 counsel to review and comment upon information pursuant to the terms of the Martinez Stipulation of
 28 Settlement, Plaintiffs' counsel shall make good faith efforts (e.g., double deleting) to delete all

1 electronic versions of the information (including, but not limited to, emails and pdfs). Within the same
 2 three (3) business day time frame, Plaintiffs' counsel will also return any hard copies to Defendant's
 3 counsel or verify in writing that the documents have been deleted or shredded. In the event that SSA
 4 submits additional similar technical information to Plaintiffs' counsel for review that is substantively
 5 related to a prior set of draft technical agency system/coding instructions previously submitted to
 6 Plaintiffs' counsel that Plaintiffs' counsel has since deleted or returned to SSA pursuant to this
 7 paragraph, SSA will provide the prior draft(s) back to Plaintiffs' counsel if requested to do so in writing
 8 and if Plaintiffs' counsel provides reasoning/justification for the request. The parties shall meet and
 9 confer in good faith to resolve any disputes regarding the reasoning/justification for such requests.

10 4. This Stipulation and Protective Order is without prejudice to the right of any party to seek
 11 modification of it from the Court. It shall remain in effect until such time as it is modified, amended or
 12 rescinded by the Court. Though this litigation has resolved, this Stipulation and Protective Order shall
 13 survive this action. The Court shall have continuing jurisdiction to modify, amend, or rescind this
 14 Stipulation and Protective Order notwithstanding resolution and settlement of this action.

15
 16 **IT IS SO STIPULATED**

17 Dated: March 23, 2010

Respectfully Submitted,

JOSEPH P. RUSSONIELLO
 United States Attorney

19 By: /s/
 20 VICTORIA R. CARRADERO
 Assistant United States Attorney


Attorneys for Defendant

23 Dated: March 23, 2010

24 By: /s/
 GERALD McINTYRE
 Lead Attorney for Plaintiffs

25 **PURSUANT TO STIPULATION IT IS SO ORDERED.**

27 DATED: March 25, 2010

28 
 The Honorable Claudia Wilken
 United States District Court Judge